

GREEN GOOD GOVERNANCE: A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF PAKISTAN'S FEDERAL POLICIES ON CLIMATE CHANGE

Muhammad Nawaz Masroor Alam Shah¹, Dr. Ahsan Riaz^{*2}

¹Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Political Science, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan

^{*2}Department of Political Science, the Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan

[*2ahsan.riaz@iub.edu.pk](mailto:ahsan.riaz@iub.edu.pk)

ABSTRACT

Pakistan is a country which has been ranked fifth by the German climate risk index in terms of the vulnerability which climate change poses. The extreme environmental events such as unnatural periods of rain, fast melting of the glaciers, acidification of oceans, destruction of the coral reefs, biodiversity depletion and the rising levels of the sea in particular at unprecedented rate compels serious actions to be taken in relation to climate governance in Pakistan. Climate change has put the lives of millions of people at stake. People have been forced to migrate from one place to another in search of food, water, shelter and even to save their lives which is now being compromised with every passing day. The sensitivity of the issue is also evident from the fact that the office of the high commissioner of United Nations has already linked climate change with human right. Therefore, international institutions put several obligations on states which are to be followed in the context of climate governance. This research article aims to explore the federal policy of Pakistan by drawing a special emphasis on good governance, explicitly in the context of climate change. The research also analyzes and interprets coherence between international framework for green governance with Pakistan's policy narrative on it. Qualitative and analytical method of investigation will be carried out. The data will be collected from official policy reports published by Ministry of Climate Change of Pakistan. The published research articles in environmental journals and newspapers will also be considered for data collection and analysis. The findings of this research will allow government of Pakistan to adopt resilience and mitigation policies for sustainable development which will reflect the international standards.

KeyWords: Climate Change, Federal Policy, Green Governance and Pakistan.

INTRODUCTION

The devastating impacts of the climate change have been felt by the whole world globally however there are few countries to name which are ranked among the most vulnerable to the impacts of climate change. Unfortunately, Pakistan happens to be at number five of them. This has been documented by the German climate risk index. In their official report published in 2021 it has been very clearly written that in the coming years Pakistan may even be counted to be

at third or even in the fourth position. This alarming situation is very much dangerous for a country like Pakistan, who have a weak socio political system and economic structure which plays a key role in taking the counter measures in its national policy for providing safeguards. These safeguards are to be taken for not only infrastructural and economic perspective but should also be made to become the guardian of the basic human rights of people. If we talk about

quantification of the emissions in terms of the total greenhouse gas contribution of Pakistan globally, then we will be shocked to know that Pakistan contributes to only less than 1% amount of the global greenhouse emissions. However, this catastrophe has put Pakistan at number 5 among 198 countries of the whole world. The current threats and dangers which are associated in terms of climate change with special reference to human rights has been repeatedly address by United Nations in the office of the high commission of the human rights. Several resolutions in the general assembly of the United Nations have been passed so far to handle and tackle this matter under the paradigm of international law and global green governance. The office of the high commission of the human rights is of the view that very soon proper international registration in the forms of the treaties as well as acts will be made to give it a proper international legal effect as well.

If we roll back to the core idea of the governance, we will be able to understand that governance in itself is based upon the policies of the government which are being laid down by the ministries as well as by the legislature. Governance on the other hand is nothing but the implementation of those policies in an efficient manner. It also includes that all the subjectivity and objectivity including the core idea of the policies are required to be executed properly. This happens within the paradigm of advanced bureaucratic functionalities. When it comes to the idea of green good governance, all the objectives, actions in which these advanced bureaucratic functionalities have been carried out must be in the coherence with the environmental friendly agendas. These are the agendas which are not only set by the Nations states in itself but are also given at the international level through many of the international Institutions particularly the United Nations.

Therefore, the green good governance is a kind of a governance in which the environment of the people is protected in a multidimensional way, where the basic necessities including the needs, wants and demands of the people should not be compromised at any cost. In other words, the people are able to live in an environment, which is

healthy enough for their adequate living. The right to access green belts in the urban cities including the clean water to drink, the clean air to breathe as well as the clean infrastructural development to live is insured within the paradigm of the governance.

The second and the most important aspect is primarily and majorly based upon all the international legislations, treaties, conventions, conferences, negotiations and particularly based upon the international institutions which exclusively and explicitly laid down the functional and structural framework of the green governance. Thus the green good governance in itself is a dependent variable of the basic environmental rights of the people within the paradigm of the good governance. In this way they are protected, safeguarded and moreover they do not have any sense of deprivation of their environmental rights.

The Literature Review

Waheed, Abdul and Thomas Bernward Fischer are of the opinion that in order to achieve good governance in the climate change sector, there has to be an intergovernmental consultation with coherence between Federal and provincial level regarding policy making (Waheed et al., 2021).

Imran Lei and Hongdou writes that Pakistan is the country which has been repeatedly affected by adverse impacts of climate change due to extreme floods. Many institutions of Pakistan are working to overcome this problem through infrastructural development, however Pakistan still lacks the capacity and capability for future forecast in this regard. Therefore, there has to be a proper mechanism to ensure the safety and security of people from these floods by early warning systems (Khan et al., 2021).

Gulnaz Anjum and Rubella Fraser argues that there are many slow onsets of the events which are related to climate change in Pakistan. Much research has already been carried out on the physical aspect with this regard however the social, psychological and institutional impact of climate change have not been touched by many researchers. Climate change creates massive problems for socially marginalized communities

and particularly the women and children (Anjum & Fraser, 2021).

Muhammed Mumtaz argues that the role of civil society has got great importance for managing the issue of climate change as recently the government's strategy for clean and green Pakistan was welcomed the stakeholders of Islamabad, thus further enabling the green and blue infrastructural development within the city. Such policies by the Federal government leads to sustainable and healthy environment (Mumtaz, 2021).

Shujaat Abbas is of the opinion that due to prolonged droughts and uneven rainy spells, the agricultural yields in Pakistan is adversely affected. Farmers are bound to face the negative impacts of climate change and their economic conditions are getting worst from the bad (Abbas, 2022).

Shabir Hussain and others are of the view that the role of media in creating climate awareness and promoting the threat indicators can play decisive and significant role in reshaping the whole social and political scenario of Pakistan. Infact, media has got the great responsibility to articulate the green interests of the people in Pakistan. In the past the issue of climate change was not given too much preference from the media, however now it's given preference (S. Hussain et al., 2022).

Aamir Inam Bhutta and others are of the view that good governance has got the key role to be performed in the areas of green innovation, clean energy production, and financial development as well. If a country needs to achieve sustainability in this types of green projects, than the role of green good governance is the one, which will be required at the first instance to achieve the longevity while fighting against climate change at the same time (Bhutta et al., 2022).

Syed Quaid Ali Shah and others are of the view that the concept of green good governance is not only limited to the state in itself but it now has entered into industrialization sectors. With the help of this concept the oil and gas companies are now more secure in generating their new policies and particularly with reference to safeguarding the interests of their shareholders respectively. The authors also have the opinions that the green governance works as a key tool for providing not

only a healthy relationship of these companies with the state but also enables a clean, green and healthy environment for the people of Pakistan (Shah et al., 2022).

Jahira Debbarma and Yongrok Choi writes that the need, want and demand for the green projects is continuously on the rise, therefore it requires a proper management process under which such projects and green bureaucratic functionalities are to be monitored and governed. This is the point where the comes concept of green governance comes inn as it also covers the taxable area within the framework of these projects. This factor will also work on the sustainable development as well because it includes the structural design for reducing the carbon dioxide emissions while having a separate action plan for the policy makers as well (Debbarma & Choi, 2022).

Ali, Shahid and others are of the opinion that as the time is passing by, the whole world is gradually shifting towards green energy based projects, where the dependency on coal and oil is getting lower. At the same time there is also a great shift towards the governance within search transition. That shift demands and requires new policy management tools and adaptive bureaucratic roles as well to be performed by not only the state but also by the industrial sectors of the society. Hence the concept and requirement for the green governance becomes an essential requirement of the 21st century without which these green projects may be compromised accordingly (Ali et al., 2022).

Farzana Zaheer Arshad and others writes that the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf has got many other policy initiative regarding climate change particularly with reference to clean and green projects, however they still lacked the administrative actions for the proper execution of these projects. The writer calls for a proper advance public management tools for the their implementation in full swing, so that, it could be seen practically as well (Syed et al., 2022).

Jin, Cheng and others are of the opinion that when it comes to the sustainable development in the context of climate change, the social, economic and environmental factors are the one which perhaps performs the major role in quality enhancement. However, the other aspect which

includes the adaptation of green technological tools are the one which also needs to work in coherence with the above mentioned areas. That blend requires institutional green governance for a prosperous sustainable future with the integration of modern technologies while fighting the climate change at the same time (Jin et al., 2022).

Asma Jabeen and Saud Ahmed Khan are of the opinion that societal inclusion towards the adaptation plans in the context of climate change is perhaps very much important in achieving resilience against climate change. The international integration into the policy framework mechanism of states to act according to the international obligations is mandatory aspect. That factor perhaps enables the green growth to achieve its sustainability in Pakistan. The authors also showcases the current position of Pakistan which is subject to the vulnerability for achieving long term sustainability as natural resources are depleting on a pace which Pakistan has not witnessed before (Jabeen & Khan, 2022). Salman Arshad and others quotes that the urban cities of Pakistan are gradually losing the green spaces for public. The writer put their opinion by showcasing the city of Lahore as an example, as its citizen are not able to reach at greenbelts particularly in the summer. This happens due to unplanned urbanization without having a distinctive urbanized policy which could run in achieving the long-term sustainability goals against climate change. Therefore the policies related to urbanization lacks the climate action for achieving the satisfaction under the international obligations to climate change (Arshad et al., 2022). Muhammed Shahid and others throws the light over the initiative of government of Pakistan towards green transport mechanism in which Pakistan is giving a good amount of relief towards taxes for environmental friendly vehicles, particularly which are run on electric batteries. Such aspects enable a sustainable transportation system in Pakistan which is more cost effective and environmental friendly. These policy decisions will also impact the economic dimension as well because millions of dollars will be invested in important these electric vehicles in Pakistan by local investors (Shahid et al., 2022).

According to Hamza Naeem and Lubna Riaz the renewable energy source is perhaps the best which can replace and replenish the traditional energy sources in Pakistan which are based on coal and oil. This will help Pakistan in achieving its goal towards a sustainable future in the context of climate change. The writers puts their opinion by highlighting the current need of the electricity shortfall in Pakistan and therefore tells the importance of small scaled wind, solar and hydro projects which could contribute towards the requirements of energy from the massive urban and ruler areas of Pakistan (Naeem & Riaz, 2022). Ryan and other through light over the importance of sustainable cities in Pakistan, without which the basic necessities of the people will be compromised. Climate change calls an urgent and immediate action to be taken by the policy makers for a green infrastructural development in which proper adaptation and mitigation strategies can not only be seen but should also be available as services on the disposal of the people. Therefore, its relationship with green urban planning is directly proportional to constructive policy making for ensuring an environment which is ecofriendly at the same time (Rayan et al., 2022). Javed and others point out in research that green infrastructural development with special reference to urban planning is required to be taken out by the Ministry of climate change. That will foster and enable a changing urban planning design towards a paradigm shift with element of sustainability. These are the initiatives and steps which requires a proper strategic environmental assessment and they should be carried out through institutional participation from local level two national level (Javed & Hobson, 2022). Khan et al., (2020) analyzes critically print media acts concluding it as a tool in the monopoly of capitalists which is suggested as stereotyped ideological construction of Nawabs in Baluchistan (Ramzan & Khan, 2019). Then Ramzan et al., (2021) have highlighted critically exploitation and manipulation of powerful strata which is confirmed as a collusive stance (Ramzan et al., 2021). Bhutto and Ramzan (2021) studied critically the agenda of pacifier stance in media wrapped in ideology that is further explored by Nawaz et a., (2021) by striving power in negative

us and positive them. Saeed, Fahad and others throws the light on Pakistan's vulnerability from the effects of climate change and global warming. The writers highlight different sectors of Pakistan which are subject to an onset of serious consequences. These sectors include agriculture, human health, livestock industries, rural and urban marginalized communities and particularly the destruction of natural ecosystem of Pakistan. The Incorporation of climate change mitigation and adaptation strategies should come forward as a national agenda to handle, manage and tackle such impacts (Saeed & Salik, 2022).

M.M Hussain and others points out that due to uncontrolled anthropogenic activities, the air pollution into the atmosphere has increased so much that it has trapped the natural heat of the sun which is required to go back into the atmospheric sphere under the eco system process. Therefore, that phenomena have drastically increased the temperatures in Pakistan as well. It is indeed one of the reason for which Pakistan has hosted more than thousands of deaths in every summer season. Modern day the scientists are of the opinion that 80% of the heat waves effects are only because of human activities which negatively contributes to the environment. There has to be a decent balance between these activities and urbanization so that, it its negative effects could also be manage accordingly (M. M. Hussain et al., 2022).

Research Gap

Pakistan has been actively participating in all international climate change negotiations and have tried to upgrade its federal policies which should reflect international protocols on climate change particularly with respect to green good governance. However, after a comprehensive literature review it has been found that the federal policy of Pakistan still lacs to follow the United Nations guiding principles which Pakistan should adopt for the fight against climate change so that the practical actions for green governance could be to implemented in its full spirit and humanity in this regard can also be safeguarded as well.

Problem Statement

Pakistan is the country which has been ranked fifth by the global climate change risk index. The

extreme and unnatural events of weather have created environmental challenges for people and therefore has forced the state to adopt resilience and mitigation strategies in its Federal policy for the fight against climate change. Pakistan has never faced such extremes of temperature where the people have lost their lives due to extreme heat waves and on the other hand prolonged droughts have put a devastating impact on agriculture of the country. The recent flash flooding in the Northern areas of Pakistan is also the evident from the impacts of climate change. Such trends of events call for green good governance to be implemented in its full swing.

Research Questions

- 1.Does federal policy of Pakistan reflect UN climate governance principles?
- 2.What gaps and loopholes does the federal policy of Pakistan hold in attaining green good governance for the fight against climate change?

Objectives of the Study

The objective of this research paper is to critically analyze the federal policy of Pakistan on climate change and to see its impact and reflection towards green good governance in the country. The climate governance is dependent upon federal laws, statues, orders of the courts, legislative Acts of the Parliament and the strategic schemes or functionalities of Federal bureaucracy.

Significance of the Study

This research paper has got great significance because it will work as a tool to highlight and identify the different loopholes and gaps which are present in the federal policy of Pakistan, as to ensure the green good governance in the state. Pakistan is a state seriously lacs advanced bureaucratic functionalities with regard to climate change. The Government of Pakistan can take advantages from the findings of this paper and remove governance issues after reviewing it in detail. In this way the human rights related to climate change in Pakistan will also be safeguarded and latest adaptation and mitigation policies will be showcased to Federal government officials of Pakistan for a better future.

Delimitation of Research

This study is explicitly related to green good governance in which a critical analysis of Pakistan's federal policy on climate change only will be carried out. The researcher has delimited himself to the federal rules, regulations, laws, bureaucratic orders and functionalities, the orders of the high courts and supreme courts and the parliamentary Acts in this regard only.

Methods

For the purpose of inquiry, a qualitative and analytical approach has been employed in which mostly the data will be collected through the primary source documents and reports which are explicitly published on the official web pages of the ministry of climate change of Pakistan. The secondary source data will be collected through research articles which are being published in the different journals of social sciences, newspaper columns, and magazines.

Critical Analysis

National Climate Change Policy-2021. (Updated on March 18, 2022)

One of the biggest crisis in Pakistan is nothing but the climate change and therefore the Government of Pakistan as subsequently introduced the climate change policy in Pakistan. If one critically analyzes and observe the national climate change policy of Pakistan than will be able to understand that a many subject matters of concern are discussed in it exclusively with a proper chapter wise format however, there are many of the loopholes which are also present in it. The climate change dynamics are so much complex in their nature that the climate change policy of any nation state require the full upgradation in a periodical way, in which it must show the reflection of international standards. All the international institutions, specially the UN exclusively provide the standards of environmental governance in which the climate change policy of any nation state should be reflected likewise.

The policy drafts of the Pakistan with regard to climate change indeed reflects a number of standardization which are being given by the office of the United Nation however, as discussed

earlier that there are couple of loopholes in it as well and requires the upgradation. In order to discuss that, following are the key points which demands a critical upgradation into the national climate change policy of Pakistan. First of all, the office of the high commissioner of the human rights from United Nation has exclusively expressed the Human Rights obligations to climate change over the nation states, therefore the climate change policy of Pakistan has not incorporated the human rights agenda in it.

Where are all the international human rights conventions, agreements, the universal declaration of human rights, the international covenants and all other international agreements which are currently in forced in the name of child protection and old age people protection including the human which are being demarcated by human rights council of united nations are not included into the mainstream of climate change policy of Pakistan.

On the other hand, another important aspect which can be categorized into a loophole of the national climate change policy of Pakistan is the interlinking of the Climate Change Ministry with the Ministry of Human Rights into its mainstream. As climate change is a global phenomenon and requires a global and collective effort to be taken in this regard, therefore, that collective effort also calls to be taken into the national paradigm as well. This is where the advance bureaucratic functionalities are required to be taken with mutual understanding and cooperation of the different sectors of the government. Therefore, no interlinkages of the governments departments are seen in managing the climatic disasters which are already mentioned in climate change policy.

The third important aspect is perhaps the loopholes in the form of sustainable development. We can take example of it as the implantation of the billions tsunami tree project by the government of Pakistan but in the recent floods of 2022, many areas of the Gilgit Baltistan region, which hosted this project, are vanished from the surface of the earth. Therefore, the Government of Pakistan who has invested millions of dollars through the national climate change policy was not able to conduct a sustainable development because that implantation was not carried out in

safe zones. In this regard not only Pakistan but many other countries are facing the crisis of losses and damages, where the policies due to their flaws does not reflect the element of sustainability.

Lastly the element of green good governance has got its own kind of importance because even if any country has got ideal policy measures which reflects the international standards is not able to deliver which is written, then the people of that country are the sufferer and internationally it does not reflect good practices of the public administration as well of that country. Unfortunately, Pakistan happens to be one of that. The country's low profile in its social political and economic development pushes Pakistan further into the darkest side of the good governance, because the element of willingness to carry out and implement the climate change policy is not observed by the people in the bureaucratic functionalities of the government's institutions. A clear example of it can be seen in the climate change litigation cases which are being filed into the superior courts of Pakistan. People have demanded from the judiciary, that the national climate change policy should be implemented in its full swing. An example of it can be take in Leghari v. Federation of Pakistan and many more are still in session. Ever since 2008 the full-fledged implementation of the national climate change policy is not seen and observed by the people across Pakistan.

On the other hand, the national climate change policy of Pakistan has touched the social, political and economic aspect in it, in which many of the crisis are discussed which needs the attention of the government and international community as well, however, Pakistan being a developing country holds even more challenges, as it is a country in which the people are living behind the poverty line. In such kind of situations, the nation states are not able to fully adopt resilience and mitigation policies even though, if the government have got it drafted into their manuscripts where things are written in a beautiful manner in which it is reflecting the international standardization as well.

The country who has got a weak social, political and economic structure as well as is continuously going through a political turmoil in which none of

the government is able to complete its tenure, the country in which people are not sure that the vote they have casted has gone to the same person in which they have stamped it into the election office. The country which has faced couple of expressed and many implied Martial laws (as per the statements of politicians) and the country who has been facing continuous period of extreme climatic events for couple of decades, becomes dreadfully fragile in the contribution towards the green good governance, explicitly in the name of national climate change policy.

In concluding the final remarks about the national climate change policy of Pakistan, it is duly stated, that although the Government of Pakistan has got a national climate change policy which indeed reflects many of the international standardization processes and elements, however in multiple dynamics it also so has got couple of drawbacks and weaknesses as well. These loopholes or fault lines are directly touching the dynamics of human rights. Secondly the working interlinkages between the governmental departments is not explicitly written and thirdly and lastly the aspect of green good governance is perhaps the one which requires great attention in handling and tackling the climatic situations of Pakistan because it could even threaten the nation security as well through climate conflicts and forced migrations in the result of environmental catastrophes.

Pakistan Climate Change Act, 2017

Among other Federal laws of Pakistan, the national climate change act of 2017 is perhaps one of the most important federal law which not only binds all of the provinces but also reflects the international rules regulations and the standardization which Pakistan as a country and as an international actor is willing to perform. Pakistan climate change Act of 2017 provides a complete structural and functional approach in which the climate change policy, procedures, rules as well as climate change council will work to provide assistance in this paradigm. The primary focus of the Act revolves around the establishment of Pakistan's climate change "council" in which it further elaborates the functional mechanism, under which the issue of

climate change will be addressed and managed accordingly.

In that Council, it is explicitly provided that the federal ministers of different departments will work in a collective way. It also includes the chief ministers of all the provinces to carry out its functional and structural approach. All the government officials who worked under the role of advanced bureaucratic functionalities at federal level as well as at provincial secretarial level, will also work in coordination and communication with each other. Subsequently the civil society including the members of the chambers of the commerce from across the country will also be given the opportunity to participate into all the negotiations and policy matters with their feedback.

Coming on to the functional mechanism of the climate change council, the Pakistan climate change Act very clearly provides the functional action plan as well. That also lead to the establishment of the Pakistan climate change “authority”. The in detail functionality and processes of that it in itself is also exclusively provided in which the performance of the everyday tasks and the regulations are father provided in a detailed way.

As climate change calls for a quick and immediate actions to be taken to safeguard the people and infrastructural development therefore, it also requires financial help and support in this regard therefore, climate change fund in this regard has also been mentioned in the Act where all the fiscal matters are also been laid down in this act so that the rules and proceedings regarding the spending and the borrowing of the money should also not become a problem for the authorities who are exercising their functionalities in performing the green good governance.

Lastly and most importantly the Pakistan climate change Act of 2017 throws the light over the international policies agreements conventions as well as International conferences which are exclusively made for global climate change mitigation strategies. These are the Paris agreement, the Kyoto Protocol and particularly it ratifies the United Nations Framework convention on climate change as well.

These were the three internationally recognized body which perhaps are the most important international bodies working in the name of the climate change and in the national climate change act of Pakistan 2017, explicitly writes all the names of these three bodies that, it is willing to carry out a work under the guidelines of the international treaties and institutions.

However, when coming to the negative side of the Pakistan climate change act, it must also be noted here that although discussing many other aspects of the social, political and economic development which needs to be carried out in the name of climate change exclusively, no discussions, write up or manuscript has been found on which discusses the “Human Rights” based approach to climate change.

It is so important to discuss it because in the national climate change act of 2017, we came across the communication and collaboration of different institutions which are written in section 3(a), that the states institutions will work collectively by referring the finance, agriculture, the food security department, Planning and research development, petroleum or the natural resources, science and technology, the water and power sector as well as the foreign Affairs are discussed. However, no world has been written exclusively for protecting the Human Rights which office of the high commissioner of the human rights of the United Nations had already recognized back in 2008 in its resolution number “7/3”.

Since 2008 by every passing year human rights council of United Nations have repeatedly pronounced more than 21 resolutions exclusively in the name of Climate Change and human rights. So this in itself has become a dilemma that neither the climate change policy of Pakistan nor the national climate change act of 2017 in Pakistan has explicitly mentioned the interlinkages between climate change and human rights. The last resolution by the human rights council of UN was pronounced in year 2022 under number “50/9”. The Government of Pakistan did not amalgamate these resolutions into the climate change policies therefore, a huge governance gap in is existed here.

Therefore, it is the darker side of the green good governance, where one cannot expect any kind of green governance in lieu of protecting humanity unless it is exclusively written into the policy manuscripts as well. Consequently, it is a huge literature as well as a research gap also. Thus the people of Pakistan became the victims of green good governance in this regard as well. To take the view from the positive angle, it is ratified that indeed Pakistan climate change Act has internationally and nationally recognized the major three major institutions and conventions of climate change which represents the issues of the global warming, however more focus is still required into the policy matters which could reflect the green governance in practicality as well. In this way the effective management and protections of the humanity can be taken place.

Conclusion

In concluding remarks on climate change policies in Pakistan it must be mentioned here that overall the climate change policies which are provided by National climate change Act of 2017 and the ministry of climate change do collaborate with the international standardization but only lacks certain loopholes which need to be addressed on immediate and urgent basis. Since climate change requires a global effort to be undertaken, therefore it also requires a collective effort within a nation state. That effort must not be confined with the governmental structures only, rather it should be spread over each and every citizen. In this way all the citizens of Pakistan will contribute towards their own share in helping the green good governance in the country to be taken place. The political uncertainty from which the Pakistan has always been gone through and from which Pakistan is also currently going through requires the help of the people as well. Government alone cannot govern, deliver and guarantee the protection of environmental rights of the people on their own. People have to participate into environmental friendly activities.

As the whole environmental issues are so much of a massive scale and are also multidimensional, therefore starting from the water consumption to the waste management system all matters a lot, the healthy environmental practices by the

citizens of Pakistan in terms household living particularly in the urban cities is also required. In this way the burden of the government can be reduced.

On the other hand, if we talk exclusively over the green good governance in Pakistan then we must comment here, that the government, not only at the provincial level but also at the federal level is facing many of the difficulties in the execution of the green orders. Take for example that the bureaucracy of ministry of the climate change is not able to maintain a single federal minister for at least five years. Anything which needs and implementation to be carried out requires the higher level of leadership in the foam of ministers and its secretarial staff to be present under which they can provide their services to the nation. But regrettably it doesn't happen in Pakistan, on account of political instability, long marches, national and international terrorist threats or incidents. On the other hand, uncertain environmental challenges push the bureaucratic functionalities far behind the level of satisfaction. That is why it is perhaps mandatory for each and every citizen of the country to participate in green activities by helping the government in this regard. As far as the climate action in Pakistan is considered, Pakistan got the ministry of climate change on 2nd of August 2017 whereas the devastating impacts of the climate change has started to impact Pakistan directly and indirectly far behind two decades. The damage which already has happened in those two decades is the one which no one can even quantify and on the other hand Pakistan is the country which has only contributed to less than 1% of the global greenhouse gas emissions. Therefore, in other words Pakistan is facing the dangerous consequences of the human activities of the global north and now it has been ranked among the top five countries to be the one of the most vulnerable countries from the impacts of the climate change. The green good governance must reflect the advanced bureaucratic functionalities likewise, which the technologically, socially and economically prosperous nation states practices to provide solutions to their people who are affected by environmental degradation. Therefore, in order to understand the hurdles which are into the green

good governance in Pakistan following key points have to be understood at the first instance. Pakistan is having a devastating impact of climate change for the past three decades. The ministry of climate change of Pakistan is just like a newly born institution which in itself has been created on the date of 4th of the August 2017.

Ever since the birth of the ministry of climate change, none of the Federal Minister appointed for in the ministry has completed its five years of governance tenure in it. The continued unrest into the political paradigm of Pakistan has further pushed the role of bureaucracy in green governance to a corner, where the efficiency and effectiveness is not being felt by the people. United Nations Human rights council back in the 2008 has acknowledged the amalgamation of Climate Change and human rights, so in that contact the Pakistan should also have at least recognized the same. However, it's year 2022 which already is ending and still Pakistan has not amalgamated both of these two Ministries in the similar context. Thus no amalgamation and collaboration of the ministry of climate change with the Ministry of Human Rights under the element of coordination and communication with each other is seen.

The official website of the ministry of human rights of Pakistan doesn't address the Human Rights based approach to climate change as well. On the official website of the ministry of human rights of Pakistan, the section of international coordination of the Ministry under the paradigm of international treaties made for human rights, the ministry shows its obligations to follow such international rules but no word of the climate change is being written in it. That is the obligation which the human rights council of the United Nation already had put back in year 2008. On the nation states are asked for their periodic reports. In fact, the human rights council of United Nations also provided a questionnaire to be filled up by the nation states as to know that what kind of Human Rights based obligations does their own states are facing due to the devastating impact of climate change but no such kind of manuscript or any policy document is being found. Therefore, the element of lack of green good governance also

lays under the green environmental rights paradigm as well.

Finally, in concluding all, for understanding the true problem statement in performing the green governance one must critically see the catastrophe level of climate change in which Pakistan is at this highest level among 198 countries. These facts also call green governance to be at the top and the highest level in Pakistan. Without which the challenges will not be handled. The people who are executing such bureaucratic roles must also be fully trained and professional. Therefore, another question arises that how can a ministry which in itself is just like a newly born baby and repeatedly changes its top leadership (the federal minister), can be so mature enough to handle the crisis which is at the highest level of the world. So not only policy measures in adaptation and mitigation is required but also training and professional profile of the people who are exercising the green governance, must also be at the highest level of professionalism and should be trained enough to provide and deliver what actually is required. It is not only the matter of sustainable development but also a matter of sustainable term of employment as well, where ministers can at least have an opportunity to complete tenure of governance to perform their good jobs and are not changed before the due time. For the past decade the ministries in Pakistan, including the ministry of climate change are changing just like the unprecedented environmental change in Pakistan. Furthermore, while discussing the element of green governance, a leading question arises here that how can any minister for climate change perform to provide any relief for the people of Pakistan who himself or herself doesn't know about the sustainability of his own term of governance. Therefore, such type of political environment within the country doesn't allow the environmental governance to attain prosperity and sustainability. The above-mentioned arguments conclude that political stability is the primary bloodline for any state to perform its governance including green governance. When any country faces political turmoil then the aftershocks may put the people and the nation states to a corner from which simple political decisions remains inadequate to provide the relief and special

measures may sometimes lead to unconstitutional activities as well. The lateral statement is given in the context of national security crisis which is related to climate change.

The current forced migration in the result of climate change has also created multiple conflicts and disputes over natural resources in distributed locality across Pakistan. These conflicts if are not cured on time then things may go otherwise for Pakistan and subsequently, it puts a huge responsibility over the shoulders of people exercising green good governance.

Recommendations and Suggestions

1. There should be International conferences held exclusively in the name of green governance in Pakistan in which scholars and scientists from different international academic institutes participate and provide the recommendation for Pakistan. The findings of their research papers can really contribute towards country's green governance. Such international conferences should be held on a regular and periodical basis under the supervision of not only the Government of Pakistan but also by the civil society as well. In this way public awareness will also start growing regarding the challenges of climate change.

2. All the provincial and Federal policies in Pakistan including the laws and statues which are related to environmental aspects in the country must reflect the international standardization under the umbrella of United Nations.

3. The aspect of Human Rights obligations to climate change must be exclusively and explicitly mentioned into the policy manuscripts of government of Pakistan including the interlinkages of the working of ministry of climate change with ministry of human rights as well in the context of climate change.

4. The recent floods in Pakistan calls for the climate justice from the international community particularly from the global north who are the major contributors of the greenhouse gas emissions into the atmosphere. Therefor a proper pleading under legal paradigm in this regard has to be carried out in United Nations general assembly to showcase the vulnerability of Pakistan. Government of Pakistan must perform such actions under the umbrella of "Warsaw

international mechanism for the loss and damage" by reflecting the manuscripts of COP-19 which was held on November 2013 in Warsaw Poland. Such actions by government of Pakistan is an integral part of green governance which needs to be performed at international level as well.

5. The role of civil society in articulating the national interest in the context of green governance plays a pivotal role in to the social political and economic development of Pakistan. Therefore, the social and economic elites in Pakistan who are the major stakeholders of industrial sector, must come forward with the agenda of climate governance. Such actions will not only support the corporate governance but will also provide a new paradigm for industrial sector as well in reducing the greenhouse gas emissions and carrying out sustainable economic development at the same time.

6. The national academic institutes of Pakistan can play a pivotal role in building up awareness regarding climate change programs by involving the youth in environmental friendly activities. The walks by the school and university students with play cards and banners related to climate change matters a lot in it. This also includes the responsibility of electronic and print media by promoting the green interest of Pakistan through social media.

7. The role of green governance is not only limited to social and economic sector only. It extends to the area of science and technology as well. Proper quantification and calculation of the vulnerability index of Pakistan has to be carried out by the scientists of Pakistan with the collaboration of international scientists as well. This will help Pakistan in analyzing the true need, want and demand which is required to provide the relief for the people and built an infrastructure which can handle the stress of environmental challenges at the same time.

8. The interlinkages of the officials of Pakistan meteorological organization with reputable international scientific bodies like World Meteorological Organization and NASA also falls under green governance. Among others, these are the two institutes are the one, which repeatedly provides satellite images based on scientifically

collected data to assess the before and after satellite images of climate catastrophe in Pakistan. 9. Lastly, the core element of climate governance should not only be limited to countering the melting of the glaciers, acidification of the oceans, the issues of the desertification, prolonged droughts, wildfires, the loss of biodiversity, flash flooding etc., but should also spread across the countries who are leading the global climate race, like Denmark and Norway. In this way the international collaboration in environmental governance of Pakistan will be involved through the governance modeling of these countries. The outcome of it will be the new solutions for Pakistan to perform the three key roles of green governance, which are primarily the adaptation, mitigation and resilience in particular, but this time in a proper way which actually is required.

REFERENCES

- Abbas, S. (2022). Climate change and major crop production: evidence from Pakistan. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 29(4), 5406-5414. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-16041-4>
- Ali, S., Yan, Q., Irfan, M., Ameer, W., Atchike, D. W., & Acevedo-Duque, A. (2022). Green Investment for Sustainable Business Development: The Influence of Policy Instruments on Solar Technology Adoption. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fenrg.2022.874824>
- Anjum, G., & Fraser, A. (2021). Vulnerabilities associated with slow-onset events (SoEs) of climate change: multi-level analysis in the context of Pakistan. *Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability*, 50, 54-63. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cosust.2021.02.004>
- Arshad, S., Ahmad, S. R., Abbas, S., Asharf, A., Siddiqui, N. A., & ul Islam, Z. (2022). Quantifying the contribution of diminishing green spaces and urban sprawl to urban heat island effect in a rapidly urbanizing metropolitan city of Pakistan. *Land Use Policy*, 113, 105874. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2021.105874>
- Bhutta, A. I., Ullah, M. R., Sultan, J., Riaz, A., & Sheikh, M. F. (2022). Impact of green energy production, green innovation, financial development on environment quality: a role of country governance in Pakistan. *Int. J. Energy Econ. Policy*, 12, 316-326. <https://doi.org/10.32479/ijeep.11986>
- Bhutto, J., & Ramzan, M. (2021). ENGLISH: Verses of Quran, Gender Issues, Feminine Injustice, and Media Transmission-CDA of Pakistani Press Reports. *Rahat-ul-Quloob*, 111-126.
- Debbarma, J., & Choi, Y. (2022). A taxonomy of green governance: A qualitative and quantitative analysis towards sustainable development. *Sustainable Cities and Society*, 79, 103693. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scs.2022.103693>
- Hussain, M. M., Qadeer, A., Farooqi, Z. U. R., & Hameed, M. A. (2022). Climate Change Hastening Heatwaves: A Pakistan Scenario. In *Climate Change* (pp. 103-116). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-86290-9_7
- Hussain, S., Khan, A., & Zubair Iqbal, M. (2022). Media reporting of climate change crisis in Pakistan: Identifying corrective strategies. *Information Development*, 02666669221104612. <https://doi.org/10.1177/02666669221104612>
- Jabeen, A., & Khan, S. A. (2022). Economic growth, social inclusion, and environmental protection: assessing the existence of green growth in Pakistan. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-022-204>
- Javed, N., & Hobson, M. (2022). Urban Sector Inclusion in the Revised Nationally Determined Contributions of Pakistan. <https://doi.org/10.22617/BRF220101-2>
- Jin, C., Shahzad, M., Zafar, A. U., & Suki, N. M. (2022). Socio-economic and environmental drivers of green innovation: evidence from nonlinear ARDL. *Economic Research-Ekonomska Istraživanja*, 1-21. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2022.2026241>
- Khan, I., Lei, H., Shah, A. A., Khan,

- I., & Muhammad, I. (2021). Climate change impact assessment, flood management, and mitigation strategies in Pakistan for sustainable future. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 28(23), 29720-29731. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-12801-4>
- Khan, D. M. A., Malik, M. R., & Dar, S. (2020). Deconstruction of Ideological Discursivity in Pakistani Print Media Advertisements from CDA Perspective: Pakistani Print Media Advertisements from CDA Perspective. *Erevna: Journal of Linguistics and Literature*, 1(1), 57-79. <https://doi.org/10.1234/ejll.v1i1.36>
- Mumtaz, M. (2021). Role of civil society organizations for promoting green and blue infrastructure to adapting climate change: Evidence from Islamabad city, Pakistan. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 309, 127296. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2021.127296>
- Naeem, M. H., & Riaz, L. M. (2022). Renewable Energy-Based Distributed Generation in Pakistan: Status, Importance, and Electrification Opportunities. *Policy Perspectives*. [https://doi.org/10.13169/polipers.19.1.ra3006-7030\(P\)-3006-7022](https://doi.org/10.13169/polipers.19.1.ra3006-7030(P)-3006-7022)
- Nawaz, S., Aqeel, M., Ramzan, M., Rehman, W., & Tanoli, Z. A. (2021). LANGUAGE, REPRESENTATION AND IDEOLOGICAL STANCE OF BRAHUI IN COMPARISON WITH URDU AND ENGLISH NEWSPAPERS HEADLINES. *Harf-O-Sukhan*, 5(4), 267-293.
- Ramzan, M., & Khan, M. A. (2019). CDA of Balochistan Newspapers Headlines-A Study of Nawabs' Stereotyped Ideological Constructions. *Annual Research Journal 'Hankén'*, XI, 27-41.
- Ramzan, M., Qureshi, A. W., Samad, A., & Sultan, N. (2021). Politics as Rhetoric: A Discourse Analysis of Selected Pakistani Politicians' Press Statements. *Humanities and Social Sciences Review*, (9), 3.
- Ramzan, Malik, Hira Jalil Awan, Muhammad Ramzan, and Hurria Maharvi. "Comparative Pragmatic Study of Print media discourse in Baluchistan newspapers headlines." *Al-Burz* 12, no. 1 (2020): 30-44.
- Rayan, M., Gruehn, D., & Khayyam, U. (2022). Frameworks for Urban Green Infrastructure (UGI) Indicators: Expert and Community Outlook toward Green Climate-Resilient Cities in Pakistan. *Sustainability*, 14(13), 7966. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14137966>
- Saeed, F., & Salik, K. M. (2022). The Effect of Global Climate Change on Pakistan. *Global Pakistan: Pakistan's Role in the International System*, 65. <https://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/pakistan/19335.pdf#page=77>
- Shah, S. Q. A., Lai, F.-W., Shad, M. K., & Jan, A. A. (2022). Developing a Green Governance Framework for the Performance Enhancement of the Oil and Gas Industry. *Sustainability*, 14(7), 3735. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14073735>
- Shahid, M., Ullah, K., Imran, K., Masroor, N., & Sajid, M. B. (2022). Economic and environmental analysis of green transport penetration in Pakistan. *Energy Policy*, 166, 113040. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2022.113040>
- Syed, F. Z., Awan, M. W., Mushtaq, A. Q., & Kiran, I. (2022). Fighting Climate Change: A Critical Analysis of Clean Green Pakistan Initiative of Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI). *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 59(1), 230. http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/history/PDF-FILES/27_59_1_22.pdf
- Waheed, A., Bernward Fischer, T., & Khan, M. I. (2021). Climate change policy coherence across policies, plans, and strategies in Pakistan—Implications for the China–Pakistan Economic Corridor Plan. *Environmental Management*, 67(5), 793-810. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00267-021-01449-y>.